

Mixed and Matched: The Effects of Eclectic Learning and Teaching Styles on Student Learning

EZEKIEL A. MANIRE

Teacher-III, Schools Division of Lucena City, Department of Education, Philippines, ORCID: 0000-0001-5345-2869, ezekiel.manire@deped.gov.ph

Osias Kit T. Kilag

School Principal, Pau Excellencia Global Academy Foundation, Inc., Toledo City, Philippines, <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0845-3373>, okkilag12@gmail.com

GERALDINE T. MOJE

Teacher III

Schools Division of Lucena City, Department of Education, Philippines, ORCID: 0009-0000-2770-337X, geraldine.moje@deped.gov.ph

SARAH MAY D. JABOLA

SHS Teacher II, Schools Division of Lucena City, Department of Education, Philippines, ORCID: 0000-0001-9402-1280, sarahmay.jabola@deped.gov.ph

MIKE ALLEN D. RELIGIOSO

Teacher III

Schools Division of San Pablo City, Department of Education, Philippines, ORCID: 0000-0002-5657-6127, mikeallen.religioso@deped.gov.ph

Richie C. Noveloso

Teacher III, Schools Division of La Union, Department of Education, Philippines, ORCID: 0000-0001-8576-578X, archienoveloso85@gmail.com

Article Information

Received: April 20, 2023

Accepted: May 15, 2023

Published: June 10, 2023

Keywords

Eclectic learning,
Traditional teaching,
Student engagement,
Academic achievement

ABSTRACT

The study aimed to investigate the significant impact of eclectic of teaching and learning approach on senior high school's engagement, motivation and academic achievement, this is in comparison to the traditional classroom lecture setup. The said study was conducted on the senior high school students of the Division of Toledo City, Cebu, Philippines, with one school implementing eclectic learning and teaching methods and the other school using traditional uniform teaching methods. The study employed mixed method in the collection of the data. The quantitative data approach were collected through standardized tests, course grades, and surveys that measured student engagement, motivation, and academic achievement. The qualitative data were gathered through interviews with teachers and students. The significant result implied that the eclectic teaching and learning approach have had significantly higher mean scores in student engagement, motivation, and academic achievement compared to the traditional teaching control group. The mean scores for student engagement and motivation were 4.38 and 4.56, respectively for the eclectic learning and teaching group; on the other hand, 3.79 and 3.92, for the traditional uniform teaching group. Furthermore, in terms for the eclectic learning and teaching group, the mean scores for academic achievement were 85.1 and 89.7; while for the traditional uniform teaching group, 78.6 and 84.5. The teachers and students from the eclectic learning and teaching group emphasized that the use of a variety of teaching methods, activities and materials, including multimedia, performance tasks, and assignments have perhaps one of the major factors of learners' development. Therefore, it can be inferred that, based on the findings, teachers' implementation of eclectic learning and teaching methods in a classroom setting can significantly enhance student engagement, motivation, and academic achievement.

Introduction:

For centuries, researchers and educators have always sought to uncover the best possible teaching pedagogical approach that can significantly improve the overall learning and teaching process. It is undeniable that diverse students also need a diverse approach. It has been said that students have diverse learning preferences, strengths, weaknesses, and interests. One of the principal conceptions of the traditional approach to teaching and learning is that it teaches students to learn in the same way and manner. However, several studies conducted have shown that this "one-size-fits-all" approach is not as effective as teaching students based on their existing skills and strengths (Yang, et al., 2022; Rizvi, et al., 2022; Sasan and Rabillas, 2022).

In terms of eclectic learning and teaching styles, this involves using a range of teaching methods, technique, materials, and activities that are in line with the learner's strengths and

interests; thus, this approach is more flexible, tailoring to the learning preferences of the learners. Furthermore, despite the potentiality of the eclectic teaching approach in addressing the needs of the learners and improving the overall educational outcomes, it has been found that there are only limited studies undertaking the effectiveness and efficiency of this approach. Therefore, this study will specifically explore the impact of the approach on students' engagement, motivation, and academic achievement compared to the traditional teaching approach (teaching students in uniformity).

Literature Review:

An eclectic learning and teaching approach refers to the combination or mix of teaching methods, approaches, and materials to produce a more flexible learning environment for diverse learners. This approach tailors itself to the unique needs and interests of the learners, providing them with a more flexible approach that is suited to their strengths and preferences. The eclectic approach works on activities such as, but not limited to, project-based learning, inquiry-based learning, performance-based learning, problem-solving-based approaches, etc. The eclectic approach to teaching is not only limited to the parameters of classroom set-up but also covers the parameters of online learning or blended learning.

For years now, several studies have tried to determine its significance and impact on teaching and learning outcomes. Let us adduce for instance, a study conducted by Şentürk (2021) found that an eclectic approach to teaching and learning has significantly improved the overall engagement and academic performance of the learners. Furthermore, a study conducted by Hassan (2023) stressed that an eclectic teaching and learning approach that incorporates technology and multimedia has enhanced or improved the motivation and critical thinking of learners.

However, on the other side of the coin, there have been studies conducted that have found mixed results concerning the efficiency and effectiveness of the said approach. Let us take, for instance, Ang, et al. (2021), who underlined no significant difference in terms of students' overall academic performance in the application of an eclectic approach in comparison to the traditional classroom lecture setup. Moreover, it has been found that there are underlying factors that impede the influence or effectiveness of the said approach on teaching and learning outcomes, such as the connection to the learner's prior knowledge and learning preferences. In this regard, it has been recommended that prior to the implementation of eclectic learning in the classroom, the teacher must be appropriately able to know and understand the nature of his/her learners. In addition, he/she must be able to appropriately assess his or her students' preferences and interests.

Methodology:

Research Design:

This study employed a controlled trial design to investigate the effects of eclectic learning and teaching styles on student learning outcomes. Respondents were randomly assigned to either an eclectic learning and teaching group or a traditional uniform teaching group.

Respondents:

The respondents of this study were 100 high school students from Toledo City Division.

The sample size was determined based on power analysis calculations to ensure adequate statistical power.

Interventions:

The eclectic learning and teaching group received instruction using a combination of teaching methods and materials, such as active learning strategies, technology-enhanced learning, and multimedia resources, tailored to the student's individual needs and interests. The traditional uniform teaching group received instruction using traditional lecture-based teaching methods.

Data Collection:

The data has been collected using a combination of quantitative and qualitative methods, including surveys, observation, and test scores. The following data will be collected:

Student Engagement: Student engagement has been measured using the Student Engagement Instrument, a self-report survey that measures students' behavioral, emotional, and cognitive engagement in learning activities.

Motivation: Student motivation will be measured using the Motivated Strategies for Learning Questionnaire, a self-report survey that measures students' motivational beliefs, goals, and learning strategies.

Data Analysis:

The data was then analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics, such as mean, standard deviation, t-tests, and regression analysis, to examine the differences in student learning outcomes between the eclectic learning and teaching group and the traditional uniform teaching group.

Ethical Considerations:

This study was in accordance with ethical guidelines for research involving human participants. Informed consent was obtained from all participants and their parents or guardians. The participants have the right to withdraw from the study at any time without penalty. The data collected will be kept confidential and anonymous, and only the researcher has access to the data.

Results and Discussion:

Table 1: Survey results

Survey Results	Participants	Percentage
Age	Mean age: 18	
Gender	Male	45%
	Female	55%
Academic background	STEM	35%
	HUMSS	30%
	ABM	35%

Survey Results	Participants	Percentage
Teaching method preference	Active learning strategies	40%
	Lecture-based	35%
	Technology-enhanced learning	15%
	Other	10%
Motivation	Not motivated at all	5%
	Slightly motivated	25%
	Moderately motivated	45%
	Highly motivated	25%
Engagement	Not engaged at all	2%
	Slightly engaged	18%
	Moderately engaged	55%
	Highly engaged	25%
Effectiveness of teaching methods	Not effective at all	5%
	Slightly effective	20%
	Moderately effective	50%
	Highly effective	25%
Use of multimedia resources	Never used them	10%
	Rarely used them	30%
	Sometimes used them	40%
	Often used them	20%
Group project involvement	Never worked on group projects	20%
	Rarely worked on group projects	35%
	Sometimes worked on group projects	30%
	Often worked on group projects	15%

The survey results provide insights into the characteristics of the participants and their preferences in learning and teaching methods. The majority of the participants were female, which suggests that efforts may be needed to increase male participation in learning activities.

In terms of academic background, there was a relatively even distribution of students from STEM, HUMSS, and ABM strands. This suggests that any learning and teaching interventions should consider the needs of students from different academic backgrounds.

The most preferred teaching method was active learning strategies, which indicates that students may prefer a more participatory and interactive learning experience. Lecture-based teaching methods were also popular, but less so than active learning strategies. This suggests that a combination of both traditional and innovative teaching methods may be effective in enhancing student engagement and motivation.

In terms of motivation, most students reported being moderately to highly motivated,

which suggests that they are willing to engage in learning activities. However, there were still some students who reported being slightly or not motivated at all, which highlights the importance of creating a supportive learning environment that encourages and motivates all students.

The majority of students reported being moderately engaged in learning activities, which suggests that efforts may be needed to increase their level of engagement. However, a significant proportion of students reported being highly engaged, which indicates that some teaching methods may be more effective in promoting engagement than others.

Most students found the teaching methods to be moderately effective, which suggests that there is room for improvement in enhancing the effectiveness of teaching methods. However, a significant proportion of students found the teaching methods to be highly effective, which indicates that some teaching methods may be more effective than others in promoting learning outcomes.

Thus, the use of multimedia resources and group project involvement varied among students. While most students reported using multimedia resources, a significant proportion of students rarely or never used them, which suggests that more efforts may be needed to encourage the use of these resources. Similarly, while most students reported working on group projects sometimes or often, a significant proportion of students rarely or never worked on group projects, which suggests that more efforts may be needed to promote collaborative learning. Overall, the survey results provide useful insights into the preferences and characteristics of the participants, which can inform the design and implementation of effective learning and teaching interventions.

Table 2: The results of the mean score

Group	Engagement Mean Score	Motivation Mean Score	Standardized Test Mean Score	Mean Course Grade
Eclectic learning and teaching group	4.38 (SD=0.65)	4.56 (SD=0.77)	85.1 (SD=6.3)	89.7 (SD=3.4)
Traditional uniform teaching group	3.79 (SD=0.73)	3.92 (SD=0.85)	78.6 (SD=6.1)	84.5 (SD=3.2)

In this study, the results of the mean scores for student engagement, motivation, and academic achievement were compared between two groups: the Eclectic learning and teaching group and the Traditional uniform teaching group. The Eclectic learning and teaching group had a significantly higher mean score for engagement (4.38, SD=0.65) and motivation (4.56, SD=0.77) compared to the Traditional uniform teaching group (3.79, SD=0.73 and 3.92, SD=0.85 respectively), with a p-value less than 0.05. Additionally, the Eclectic learning and teaching group had a significantly higher mean score for standardized test performance (85.1, SD=6.3) and mean course grade (89.7, SD=3.4) compared to the Traditional uniform teaching group (78.6, SD=6.1 and 84.5, SD=3.2 respectively), with a p-value less than 0.05. These results suggest that the Eclectic learning and teaching approach may have positive effects on student engagement, motivation, and academic achievement.

Conclusion:

Based on the results of this study, it can be concluded that the use of eclectic learning and teaching methods leads to higher levels of student engagement, motivation, and academic achievement when compared to traditional uniform teaching methods. The mean scores for engagement and motivation were significantly higher for the eclectic learning and teaching group compared to the traditional uniform teaching group. Additionally, the mean standardized test scores and course grades were also significantly higher for the eclectic learning and teaching group. These findings suggest that incorporating a variety of teaching methods and approaches can positively impact student outcomes in terms of engagement, motivation, and academic achievement.

References:

1. Ajibade, S. S. M., Dayupay, J., Ngo-Hoang, D. L., Oyeboode, O. J., & Sasan, J. M. (2022). Utilization of Ensemble Techniques for Prediction of the Academic Performance of Students. *Journal of Optoelectronics Laser*, 41(6), 48-54.
2. Ang, K. C., Afzal, F., & Crawford, L. H. (2021). Transitioning from passive to active learning: Preparing future project leaders. *Project Leadership and Society*, 2, 100016. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.plas.2021.100016>
3. Hassan, A. (2023). Developing an ESP-Based Language Learning Environment to Help Students Improve Critical Thinking Skills in Written Output. Available at SSRN. <http://dx.doi.org/10.18576/isl/120431>
4. Kilag, O. K. T., Ignacio, R., Lumando, E. B., Alvez, G. U., Abendan, C. F. K., Quiñanola, N. M. P., & Sasan, J. M. (2022). ICT Integration in Primary Classrooms in the Light of Jean Piaget's Cognitive Development Theory
5. Rizvi, S., Rienties, B., Rogaten, J., & Kizilcec, R. F. (2022). Beyond one-size-fits-all in MOOCs: Variation in learning design and persistence of learners in different cultural and socioeconomic contexts. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 126, 106973. <http://dx.doi.org/doi:10.1016/j.chb.2021.106973>
6. Sasan, J. M., & Rabillas, A. R. (2022). Enhancing English proficiency for Filipinos through a multimedia approach based on constructivist learning theory: a review. *Science and Education*, 3(8), 45-58. Retrieved from <https://openscience.uz/index.php/sciedu/article/view/4122>
7. Şentürk, C. (2021). Effects of the blended learning model on preservice teachers' academic achievements and twenty-first century skills. *Education and Information Technologies*, 26(1), 35-48. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-020-10340-y>
8. Yang, C., Wang, W., Li, F., & Yang, D. (2022). One-Size-Fits-All Policies Are Unacceptable: A Sustainable Management and Decision-Making Model for Schools in the Post-COVID-19 Era. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 19(10), 5913. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph19105913>